

**MINUTES**  
**ALABAMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD**  
**RSA UNION STREET**  
**SUITE 370**  
**MONTGOMERY, ALABAMA**  
**January 17, 2019**

**MEMBERS PRESENT:**

Mr. Richard D. Pettey (Chairman)  
Mr. Robert Butler (Vice-Chairman)  
Mr. Billy Cotter  
Mr. Lew Watson  
Mr. Dennis Key  
Ms. Patrice McClammy  
Mr. Edmond G. Eslava, III

**MEMBERS ABSENT:**

Mr. Christopher Baker  
Ms. Angie Frost

**OTHERS PRESENT:**

Mrs. Lisa Brooks, Executive Director  
Ms. Neva Conway, Legal Counsel  
Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary  
Mr. Sam Davis, Investigator

**GUESTS PRESENT:**

Ms. Emily Marsh, Alabama Realtors Association

- 1.0 With a quorum present, Mr. Rick Pettey, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 9:04 a.m. Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary, recorded the minutes. The meeting was held in the 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Conference Room, 100 North Union Street, Montgomery, Alabama. Prior notice of the meeting was posted on the Secretary of State's website on December 14, 2018 in accordance with the Alabama Open Meetings Act.
- 2.0 The meeting was opened with prayer, led by Mr. Butler, and the Pledge of Allegiance, led by Mr. Pettey.
- 3.0 Members present were Mr. Lew Watson, Mr. Richard D. Pettey, Mr. Billy Cotter, Ms. Patrice McClammy, Mr. Edmond G. Eslava, III, Mr. Dennis Key and Mr. Robert Butler. Members absent were Ms. Angie Frost and Mr. Christopher Baker.

Mr. Pettey welcomed the Ms. Marsh to the meeting.

- 4.0 On motion by Mr. Watson and second by Mr. Key, the regular minutes for November 15, 2018 were approved as written. Motion carried by unanimous vote.
- 5.0 Ms. Conway included the Final Order from Circuit Judge James H. Roberts, Jr., Tuscaloosa County, in David Burns' Judicial Review. Judge Roberts affirmed the Final Order issued by the Board on March 16, 2017. Ms. Conway explained that Mr. Burns has forty-two days to appeal the Order and that nothing has been filed to date.
- 6.0 Ms. Conway discussed the evaluation Bill with the Board. Ms. Conway will send the proposed amendment to Mr. Watson who will send it to Sen. Dell Marsh.
- Ms. Conway discussed a proposed amendment to §34-27A-5(b)(11), Rules and regulations; powers and duties of board; immunity from suit, to allow for an investigator employed by the board to be a practicing licensee of the board. Mr. Watson will ask Sen. Dell Marsh to assist in finding a sponsor for this amendment. On motion by Mr. Eslava and second by Mr. Watson, the Board voted to submit the proposed amendment to the Legislature. Motion carried by unanimous vote.
- 7.0 On motion by Mr. Cotter and second by Ms. McClammy, the following applications were voted on as listed. Motion carried by unanimous vote.
- 7.1 **Trainee Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Gregory Adam Blankenship, Maurice Lyon Courtney, Clay Jameson Harpool, Jamie Cameron Hicks, Drew Ann Lambert, Nekia Evelyn Lee, Ginger Renee Macleod (Recip)(NC), Benjamin Ryan Sanford and David Allen Tucker. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.
- Trainee Real Property Appraiser Experience Logs for Review: Log approved:** Alexander J. Coppejans, Timothy Clayton Harris, and Casey Kitchens. **Logs deferred:** Jessica Karroll and Samuel Turner. **Logs denied:** None.
- 7.2 **State Registered Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** None. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.
- 7.3 **Licensed Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** None. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.
- 7.4 **Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** George Anthony Allen, Alexander J. Coppejans, Casey Kitchens and Ashley Griffin Vinyard. **Application deferred:** Clayton Brooks. **Applications denied:** None.

- 7.5 **Certified General Real Property Appraiser application approved:** Milton C. Bowling III (Recip)(GA), Jeffrey Simon Brown (Recip)(GA), Zach Lee Fraysier (Recip)(NC), Jason Edward Little (Recip)(GA), John Robert Norris (Recip)(GA), Morgan Lucas Peeler (Recip)(TX), Todd Brandon Thurman (Recip)(TN) and Jeffrey N. Watkins (Recip)(GA). **Application deferred:** Benjamin Gene Carpenter. **Applications denied:** None.
- 7.6 **Mentor applications approved:** David Bell and David H. Whitten. **Application deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.
- 8.0 Mr. Eslava presented the Finance report for December 2018 and stated that the Board was 25% into Fiscal Year 2019 and 23% into budget expenditures. Mr. Eslava stated that there were no negative trends that could not be reconciled at this time.
- On motion by Mr. Key and second by Mr. Watson, the Board voted to approve the Finance Report. Motion carried by unanimous vote.
- 9.0 On motion by Mr. Key and second by Mr. Butler, the following education courses and instructor recommendations were approved, deferred, or denied as indicated. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

#### **APPRAISAL INSTITUTE – ALABAMA**

##### **New Application:**

- (CE) 2<sup>nd</sup> Annual Valuation Symposium – 7 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructors: Stephen Roach, John Norris, KC Conway, Alan Tidwell, Brian Hilson and Joel Baxley)  
**Both Course and Instructors Approved**

#### **APPRAISAL INSTITUTE – NATIONAL**

##### **Renewal Applications:**

- (LIC) Quantitative Analysis Synchronous – 35 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Thomas Hamilton)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Real Estate Finance, Statistics and Valuation Modeling – 15 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Mark Smeltzer)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach – 15 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Arlen Mills)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

- (LIC) Real Estate Finance, Statistics and Valuation Modeling – 15 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Kenneth Lusht)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Residential Report Writing and Case Studies – 15 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Sandra Adomatis)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Residential and Commercial Valuation of Solar – 14 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Sandra Adomatis)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Using Your HP12C Financial Calculator – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Matthew Larrabee)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach – 30 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Arlen Mills)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach – 30 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Kenneth Foltz)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Two Day Advanced Income Capitalization / B – 14 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Ron Devries)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach – 15 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: John Urubek)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Subdivision Valuation – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Don Emerson)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

**New Applications:**

- (CE) Review Case Studies – General - Synchronous – 30 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Richard Borges)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

(CE) Small Hotel/Motel Valuation Limited Services – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: David Lennhoff)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

(CE) How Tenants Create or Destroy Value: Leasehold Valuation and  
Its Impact on Value – 7 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Gary DeWeese)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

### **HONDROS COLLEGE, INC.**

#### **New Applications:**

(LIC) 2018-2019 15-Hour Equivalent USPAP Course – 15 Hours –  
Online  
(Instructor: Elizabeth Sigg)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

(LIC) Basic Appraisal Procedures – 30 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Elizabeth Sigg)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

### **MCKISSOCK**

#### **New Applications:**

(CE) Residential Construction and the Appraiser – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

(CE) Be Compliant and Competitive with Restricted Appraisal Reports –  
Live Webinar – 3 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Dale Shea)  
**Instructor Approved**

### **OREP EDUCATION NETWORK**

#### **New Application:**

(CE) Appraisal Adjustments II: Solving Complex Problems – 7 Hours –  
Online  
(Instructor: Richard Hagar)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

### **THE COLUMBIA INSTITUTE**

#### **New Applications:**

(CE) 2018-2019 7-Hour National USPAP Update – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Heather Sullivan)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

- (CE) Mortgage, Appraisers and Foreclosures – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Heather Sullivan)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Income Approach Review – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Heather Sullivan)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Appraisal of Small Residential Income Properties – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Heather Sullivan)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

10.0 There was no disciplinary report to review at this time.

Ms. Conway discussed with the Board the investigative status charts. Ms. Conway informed the Board 3 new complaints were received since the November 2018 Board meeting, 3 complaints were dismissed, and no complaints were settled, leaving a total of 34 open complaints.

Future reports may include AMC complaints.

Ms. Conway reported that she has a disciplinary hearing scheduled for the March Board meeting.

11.0 The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-18-27**: With Mr. Butler recusing, on motion by Mr. Key and second by Mr. Eslava, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to issue a Letter of Counsel. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

12.0 The Board reviewed the Consent Settlement Order on **AB-18-03 (Bonnie Lynn Burgess, L00358)**. With Mr. Butler recusing, on motion by Mr. Eslava and second by Mr. Key, the Board voted to approve this Consent Settlement Order. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

13.0 The following reciprocal license was issued since the September Board meeting: Milton C. Bowling III ('G' GA), Jeffrey Simon Brown ('G' GA), Zach Lee Fraysier ('G' NC), Jason Edward Little ('G' GA), Ginger Renee Macleod ('T' NC), John Robert Norris ('G' GA), Morgan Lucas Peeler ('G' TX), Todd Brandon Thurman ('G' TN), and Jeffrey N. Watkins ('G' GA).

14.0 The Temporary Permit report was provided to the Board for their information.

15.0 The Appraisal Management report was provided to the Board for their information.

16.0 Mrs. Brooks informed the Board that the Examiners of Public Accounts Board Member Training would be held quarterly in September, December, March and June to give board members and staff multiple dates in which to attend. The March 2019 training session has been scheduled for March 1, 2019 and Board members, Executive Directors, accounting personnel and attorneys are highly encouraged to attend.

Mrs. Brooks discussed the Spring AARO Conference which will be in Denver, CO in May, and asked Board members who are interested in attending to let her know as soon as possible.

Mrs. Brooks presented a request from Mr. James Baker, Mentor for Lexi Ann Clark, Trainee Appraiser, for a waiver of the 50-mile radius rule. On motion by Mr. Key and second by Mr. Butler the Board voted to approve the request. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

Mrs. Brooks deferred the AMC renewal notice discussion until the March Board meeting.

Mrs. Brooks discussed a memorandum from Kathleen D. Baxter, State Comptroller, announcing that the travel mileage rate for 2019 increased to 58 cents per mile.

17.0 There was no unfinished business to discuss at this time.

#### **RE-CONSIDERATION HEARING**

At 10:05 a.m., Mr. Pettey convened the re-consideration hearing for Mr. Steven Alan Pharr on his application for a Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser license.

At 10: 57 a.m., Mr. Pettey closed the hearing.

At 10:57 a.m. on motion by Mr. Key and second by Ms. McClammy, the Board voted to enter Executive Session for the purpose of deliberating on the reconsideration of Mr. Pharr's application for Certified Residential appraiser. Mr. Pettey announced that the meeting would resume in thirty minutes. Those in favor were Mr. Key, Mr. Watson, Mr. Butler, Mr. Cotter, Ms. McClammy, Mr. Pettey and Mr. Eslava. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

At 11:23 a.m. on motion by Ms. McClammy and second by Mr. Butler, the Board voted to re-enter Regular Session. Those in favor were Mr. Key, Mr. Watson, Mr. Butler, Mr. Cotter, Ms. McClammy, Mr. Pettey and Mr. Eslava. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

On motion by Ms. McClammy and second by Mr. Butler, the Board voted to approve Mr. Pharr's application for upgrade to Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser. After much discussion, Mr. Watson made a motion to call for the question. Mr. Eslava seconded the motion. Motion carried by unanimous vote. Mr. Pettey called for a vote on Ms. McClammy's motion to approve the application. Mr. Eslava and Mr. Watson abstained, and Mr. Key, Mr. Butler, Mr. Cotter, Ms. McClammy, Mr. Pettey voted in favor of the motion. Motion carried.

18.0 There was no new business to discuss at this time.

19.0 At 11:38 a.m., on motion by Ms. McClammy and second by Mr. Key, the Board voted to adjourn the regular Board meeting. Motion carried by unanimous vote. The Board's tentative meeting schedule for 2019 is March 21, 2019, May 16, 2019, July 18, 2019, September 19, 2019 and November 21, 2019 in the 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Conference Room, 100 North Union Street, Montgomery, Alabama.

Sincerely,

Carolyn Greene  
Executive Secretary  
/cg

**APPROVED:** \_\_\_\_\_  
Richard D. Pettey, Chairman