

MINUTES
ALABAMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD
RSA UNION STREET
SUITE 370
MONTGOMERY, ALABAMA
November 15, 2018

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mr. Richard D. Pettey (Chairman)
Mr. Robert Butler (Vice-Chairman)
Mr. Billy Cotter
Ms. Angie Frost
Mr. Lew Watson

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Mr. Christopher Baker
Mr. Dennis Key
Mr. Edmond G. Eslava, III
Ms. Patrice McClammy

OTHERS PRESENT:

Mrs. Lisa Brooks, Executive Director
Ms. Neva Conway, Legal Counsel
Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary
Mr. Sam Davis, Investigator

GUESTS PRESENT:

Ms. Emily Marsh, Alabama Realtors Association
Ms. Darlene Daugherty, Certified Residential Appraiser, Lineville
Ms. Kayla Atchley, Trainee Appraiser, Wedowee

- 1.0 With a quorum present, Mr. Rick Pettey, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 9:05 a.m. Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary, recorded the minutes. The meeting was held in the 3rd Floor Conference Room, 100 North Union Street, Montgomery, Alabama. Prior notice of the meeting was posted on the Secretary of State's website on January 3, 2018 in accordance with the Alabama Open Meetings Act.
- 2.0 The meeting was opened with prayer, led by Mr. Butler, and the Pledge of Allegiance, led by Mr. Pettey.
- 3.0 Members present were Mr. Lew Watson, Mr. Richard D. Pettey, Ms. Angie Frost, Mr. Billy Cotter, and Mr. Robert Butler. Members absent were Mr. Christopher Baker, Ms. Patrice McClammy, Mr. Edmond G. Eslava, III and Mr. Dennis Key.

Mr. Pettey welcomed the guests present and asked the Board Members and staff to introduce themselves. Mr. Pettey then asked the guests to introduce themselves.

4.0 On motion by Ms. Frost and second by Mr. Watson, the regular minutes for September 19, 2018 were approved as written. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

5.0 Ms. Conway reported that David Burns' Judicial Review is still pending.

Ms. Conway reported on the Federal Trade Commission vs Louisiana Real Estate Appraisers Board.

6.0 Ms. Conway has discussed the Board's request for an Attorney General's opinion on allowing evaluations under existing law. After further legal research, Ms. Conway recommends that the Board not go forward with a request for an Attorney General's opinion.

Ms. Conway discussed the Final Adoption of 780-X-17-.05, Expired Registration. Ms. Conway also included, for Board information, a letter from Real Estate Valuation Advocacy Association (REVAA), offering its support for these changes. On motion by Ms. Frost and second by Mr. Butler, the Board voted to adopt the rule as published, and instructed Ms. Conway to file the rule for Final Adoption. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

Ms. Conway discussed the proposed rule changes to 780-X-16-.04, Application for Reciprocal Appraiser. On motion by Ms. Frost and second by Mr. Watson, the Board voted to adopt the changes as written, file them with Legislative Reference Services Agency and to submit for final certification if no comments are received during the comment period. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

7.0 On motion by Ms. Frost and second by Mr. Watson, the following applications were voted on as listed. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

7.1 **Trainee Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Henry L. Crawford, Emily Ann Free, Taylor Porch McKenzie (Recip)(GA), Kala Yvette Nelson, Ashlyn Abbott Nilsen, Nicholas D. Risner, Thomas Bestor Ward and Anna Maria Willis. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.

Trainee Real Property Appraiser Experience Logs for Review: Log approved: Ashley Griffin Vinyard and Victor Smith. **Logs deferred:** Alexander J. Coppejans and Casey Kitchens. **Logs denied:** None.

7.2 **State Registered Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** None. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.

7.3 **Licensed Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Steven

Richard Voisinet (Recip)(NV). **Applications deferred:** None.
Applications denied: None.

7.4 **Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser applications approved:**
Larry Gant Dunn (Recip)(MI), Gregory Wayne Easter (Recip)(TN), and
John L. Wilkes. **Application deferred:** None. **Applications denied:**
Stephen Alan Pharr.

7.5 **Certified General Real Property Appraiser application approved:**
Matthew Dwight Curl (Recip)(GA), James Warren Heacock (Recip)(TX),
Adam R. Lair (Recip)(MO), Sergio Lozano (Recip)(CA), John Sokol
(Recip)(FL) and Douglas Bruce Struckman (Recip)(IL). **Application
deferred:** Benjamin Gene Carpenter. **Applications denied:** None.

7.6 **Mentor applications approved:** Anthony Carter, Joshua Chet Kuhn and
James E. Lester. **Application deferred:** None. **Applications denied:**
None.

8.0 Ms. Frost presented the Finance report for September 2018 and stated
that the Board was 100% into Fiscal Year 2018 and 73% into budget
expenditures. She also presented the Finance report for October 2018 –
FY 2019 and stated that the Board was 8% into Fiscal Year 2019 and
12% into budget expenditures. Ms. Frost stated that there were no
negative trends that could not be reconciled at this time.

On motion by Ms. Frost and second by Mr. Cotter, the Board voted to
approve the Finance Report. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

9.0 On motion by Mr. Cotter and second by Mr. Butler, the following
education courses and instructor recommendations were approved,
deferred, or denied as indicated. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

APPRAISAL INSTITUTE – NATIONAL

Renewal Applications:

(LIC) 2018-2019 15 Hour National USPAP Course – 15 Hours –
Classroom
(Instructor: Thomas Kirby)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

(LIC) 2018-2019 15 Hour National USPAP Course – 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Thomas Kirby)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

(CE) 2018-2019 7 Hour Equivalent USPAP Update Course – 7 Hours –
Online
(Instructor: Craig Harrington)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) 2018-2019 7 Hour USPAP Update Course – 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Thomas Kirby)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Advanced Concepts and Case Studies – 38 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Kerry Jorgensen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Advanced Income Capitalization - Synchronous – 35 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Thomas Kirby)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Advanced Land Valuation: Sound Solutions to Perplexing Problems – 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Brett W. Hall)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Advanced Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use – 35 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Kerry Jorgensen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Advanced Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use Synchronous – 35 Hours – Online
(Instructors: Gary DeWeese, Kerry Jorgensen and Larry Wright)
Both Course and Instructors Approved

- (LIC) Advanced Residential Applications & Case Studies, Part 1 – 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Richard Dubay)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Advanced Residential Applications & Case Studies, Part 1 - Synchronous – 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Richard Dubay)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Advanced Residential Report Writing, Part 2 – 30 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Richard Dubay)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Advanced Residential Report Writing, Part 2 - Synchronous – 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Richard Dubay)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Advanced Spreadsheet Modeling for Valuation Applications – 14 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Jim Amarin)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Analyzing Operating Expenses – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Ken Foltz)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Analyzing Tenant Credit Risk & Commercial Lease Analysis - Synchronous – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Robert Moorman)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Applications & Interpretations of Simple Linear Regression – 14 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: John Urubek)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Appraisal of Medical Office Buildings – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Donald Sonneman)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Appraising Automobile Dealerships – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Bradley Carter)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Appraising Convenience Stores – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Robert Bainbridge)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Basic Appraisal Principles – 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Richard Dubay)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Basic Appraisal Principles – 30 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Craig Harrington)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Basic Appraisal Procedures – 30 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Thomas Kirby)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Basic Appraisal Procedures – 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Richard Dubay)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Business Practice and Ethics – 5 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Bruce Closser)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Business Practice and Ethics – 4 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Stephanie Coleman)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Case Studies in Appraising Green Residential Buildings – 7 Hours
– Classroom
(Instructor: Sandra Adomatis)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Case Studies in Appraising Green Residential Buildings – 7 Hours
– Online
(Instructor: Sandra Adomatis)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Comparative Analysis – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Arlen Mills)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Complex Litigation Appraisal Case Studies (Synchronous) – 7
Hours – Online
(Instructor: Sandra Adomatis)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Condemnation Appraising: Principles & Applications – 21 Hours –
Classroom
(Instructor: Stephen Roach)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent – 4 Hours –
Classroom
(Instructor: Thomas Hamilton)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent – Synchronous
– 4 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Thomas Hamilton)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Cool Tools: New Technology for Real Estate Appraisers – 7 Hours
– Online
(Instructor: Richard Pugh)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Data Verification Methods – 5 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Eminent Domain & Condemnation – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: John Underwood)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Evaluating Commercial Leases: The Tenant and the Terms Both Matter – 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Gary DeWeese)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Forecasting Revenue – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Ken Foltz)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Fundamentals of Separating Real, Personal Property and Intangible Business Assets – 14 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Kerry Jorgensen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) General Appraiser Income Approach Part 1 – 30 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Ron Devries)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) General Appraiser Income Approach Part 2 – 30 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Ron Devries)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) General Appraiser Income Approach Part 1 – 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: David Lennhoff)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use – 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Robert Dunham)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use – 30 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Robert Moorman)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) General Appraiser Report Writing & Case Studies – 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Robert Dunham)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) General Appraiser Report Writing & Case Studies – 30 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Dana Thornberry)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach – 30 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Dana Thornberry)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach – 30 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Larry Wright)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Ignorance Isn't Bliss: Understanding an Investigation by a State Regulatory Board or Agency – 4 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Craig Steinly)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Introduction to Green Buildings: Principles & Concepts – 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Sandra Adomatis)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Introduction to Green Buildings: Principles & Concepts – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Litigation Appraising: Specialized Topics & Applications – 15 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Stephen Roach)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Residential Applications Part 1: Using Technology to Measure and Support Assignment Results – 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: James B. Atwood)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Residential Applications Part 2: Using Microsoft Excel to Analyze and Support Appraisal Assignment Results – 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: James B. Atwood)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Residential and Commercial Valuation of Solar – 14 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Sandra Adomatis)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use – 15 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: James B. Atwood)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Residential Sales Comparison & Income Approaches – 30 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Mark Ratterman)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Residential Report Writing and Case Studies – 15 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Alan Blankenship)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Review Case Studies - General – 30 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Stephanie Coleman)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Review Case Studies Residential - Synchronous – 14 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Craig Harrington)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Review Theory - Residential – 15 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Craig Harrington)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Rural Valuation Basics – 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Michal Tankersley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Review Theory - Residential Synchronous – 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Craig Harrington)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Solving Land Valuation Puzzles – 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Brett W. Hall)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Supervisory Appraiser / Trainee Appraiser Course – 4 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Sandy Adomatis)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Supervisory Appraiser / Trainee Appraiser Course – 4 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Sandy Adomatis)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Two Day Advanced Income Capitalization A – 14 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Ron Devries)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) The Appraiser as the Expert Witness: Preparation and Testimony – 15 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Joseph Magdziarz)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) The Discounted Cash Flow Model: Concepts, Issues and Apps – 5 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Kenneth Lusht)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Uniform Appraisal Standard for Federal Land Acquisitions: Practical Applications – 14 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: John Underwood)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Valuation of Conservation Easement – 28 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Bruce Closser)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

HONDROS COLLEGE, INC.

New Applications:

- (LIC) Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies – 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Elizabeth Sigg)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Appraising for the Supervisor Trainee – 4 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Elizabeth Sigg)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach – 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Elizabeth Sigg)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Basic Appraisal Principles – 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Elizabeth Sigg)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use – 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Elizabeth Sigg)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Residential Report Writing and Case Studies – 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Elizabeth Sigg)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approach – 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Elizabeth Sigg)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Specialized Residential Appraisal Topics – 20 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Elizabeth Sigg)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Statistics Modeling and Finance – 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Elizabeth Sigg)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

OREP EDUCATION NETWORK

Renewal Applications:

- (CE) FHA Appraisal Standards – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Lora DeAstra)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) How to Support and Prove Your Adjustments – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Richard Hagar)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Identifying and Correcting Appraisal Failures – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Richard Hager)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

New Application:

- (CE) How to Raise Appraisal Quality and Minimize Risk – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Tim Andersen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

10.0 There was no disciplinary report to review at this time.

Ms. Conway discussed with the Board the investigative status charts. Ms. Conway informed the Board 8 new complaints were received since the September 2018 Board meeting, 3 complaints were dismissed, and no complaints were settled, leaving a total of 34 open complaints.

Mr. Pettey suggested that the Board provide assistance to Ms. Conway in the trial of upcoming contested hearings by engaging an additional lawyer if needed.

11.0 Ms. Conway informed the Board that Probable Cause Report **AB-15-23** is carried over and will not be reviewed at this time.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-18-02**: With Mr. Butler recusing, on motion by Mr. Watson and second by Mr. Cotter, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-18-03**: With Mr. Butler recusing, on motion by Mr. Watson and second by Mr. Cotter, the Board voted that probable cause does exist and to set this case for a hearing. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Amended Probable Cause Report **AB-18-08**: With Mr. Butler recusing, on motion by Mr. Watson and second by Mr. Cotter, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Amended Probable Cause Report **AB-18-12**: With Mr. Butler recusing, on motion by Mr. Watson and second by Mr. Cotter, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

12.0 There were no Negotiated Settlements to review at this time.

13.0 The following reciprocal license was issued since the September Board meeting: Matthew Dwight Curl ('G' GA), Larry Gant Dunn ('R' MI), Gregory Wayne Easter ('R' TN), James Warren Heacock ('G' TX), Adam R. Lair ('G' MO), Sergio Lozano ('G' CA), Taylor Porch McKenzie ('T' GA), John Sokol ('G' FL) and Douglas Bruce Struckman ('G' IL) and Steven Richard Voisinet ('L' NV).

14.0 The Temporary Permit report was provided to the Board for their information.

15.0 The Appraisal Management report was provided to the Board for their information.

16.0 Mrs. Brooks included the Report on the Real Estate Appraisers Board from the Examiners of Public Accounts for Board information.

Mrs. Brooks informed the Board that the Examiners of Public Accounts Board Member Training would be held quarterly in September, December, March and June to give board members and staff multiple dates in which to attend. The December training session has been scheduled for December 5, 2018 and Board members, Executive Directors, accounting personnel and attorneys are highly encouraged to attend.

Mrs. Brooks included the Renewal report for Board information.

Mrs. Brooks discussed the surplus of Board owned vehicles and the purchase of a new vehicle for Mr. Davis. On motion by Mr. Watson and second by Ms. Frost, the Board voted to surplus all the Board's vehicles except for the Ford Fusion and purchase a new vehicle. Mr. Butler opposed the motion. Motion carried.

AARO attendees discussed the meeting and various topics covered.

Mrs. Brooks presented a request from Ms. Lexi Ann Clark, Trainee Appraiser, for a waiver of the 50-mile radius rule. The Board deferred the request for the Mentor to submit this request.

17.0 The Board discussed requesting an Ethics Opinion regarding contract investigators/review appraisers. Ms. Conway will contact Mr. Albritton to arrange a meeting in January regarding contract investigators/review appraisers.

18.0 Mr. Watson discussed the possibility of losing a Congressional District with the 2020 census and wondered if the Board should take action to lock in the current number of Board members. Ms. Conway will research and report back to the Board.

Mrs. Brooks discussed the Board meeting dates for 2019. The Board meetings will remain on the third Thursday of every other month.

19.0 At 10:23 a.m., on motion by Mr. Watson and second by Ms. Frost, the Board voted to adjourn the regular Board meeting. Motion carried by unanimous vote. The Board's tentative meeting schedule for 2019 is January 17, 2019, March 21, 2019, May 16, 2019, July 18, 2019, September 19, 2019 and November 21, 2019 in the 3rd Floor Conference Room, 100 North Union Street, Montgomery, Alabama.

Sincerely,

Carolyn Greene
Executive Secretary
/cg

APPROVED: _____
Richard D. Pettey, Chairman