

MINUTES
ALABAMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD
RSA UNION STREET
SUITE 370
MONTGOMERY, ALABAMA
September 15, 2016

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mr. Dennis Key (Chairman)
Ms. Angie Frost
Ms. Patrice McClammy
Mr. Lew Watson (Vice-Chairman)
Mr. Billy Cotter
Mr. Richard D. Pettey
Mr. Robert Butler
Mr. Christopher Baker

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Mr. Edmond G. Eslava, III

OTHERS PRESENT:

Ms. Neva Conway, Legal Counsel
Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary
Mr. Sam Davis, Investigator
Mr. Joe Dixon, Investigator

GUESTS PRESENT:

Mr. Charles Christopher Chatham (arrived at 9:45 a.m. for reconsideration hearing)

- 1.0 With quorum present, Mr. Dennis Key, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 9:08 a.m. Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary, recorded the minutes. The meeting was held in the 3rd Floor Conference Room, 100 North Union Street, Montgomery, Alabama. Prior notice of the meeting was posted on the Secretary of State's website on February 2, 2016 in accordance with the Alabama Open Meetings Act.
- 2.0 The meeting was opened with prayer and the Pledge of Allegiance, led by Mr. Key.
- 3.0 Members present were, Mr. Christopher Baker, Mr. Billy Cotter, Mr. Lew Watson, Ms. Angie Frost, Mr. Richard D. Pettey, Patrice McClammy, Mr. Robert Butler and Mr. Dennis Key. Mr. Edmond G. Eslava, III was absent.

4.0 On motion by Mr. Watson and second by Mr. Butler, the regular minutes for July 16, 2016 were approved as written. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

On motion by Mr. Watson and second by Mr. Butler, the corrected minutes for March 16, 2016 were approved as written. Motion carried by unanimous vote. The minutes were corrected to remove the arrival time of Ms. McClammy.

5.0 Ms. Conway informed the Board that she is working on several upcoming hearings before Administrative Law Judges.

6.0 Mr. Watson reported that there was no Legislative business to discuss at this time.

Ms. Conway discussed the Final Adoption of 780-X-17-.04, 'Registration Renewal'; and 780-X-18-.06, 'AMC Renewal Application'. On motion by Ms. Frost and second by Mr. Pettey, the Board voted to adopt the rules as published, and instructed Ms. Conway to file the rules for final adoption. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

At 9:14 a.m., Ms. Conway called for a Public Hearing on 780-X-4-.08, 'Miscellaneous Fees'. There were no comments and the public hearing was closed at 9:20 a.m.

7.0 On motion by Mr. Cotter and second by Ms. McClammy, the following applications were voted on as listed. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

7.1 **Trainee Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** James Andres Bevel and James Neil Guiler. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.

Trainee Real Property Appraiser Experience Logs for Review: Logs approved: Thomas Chase and Scott Gartman. **Log deferred:** None. **Logs denied:** None.

7.2 **State Registered Real Property Appraiser application approved:** Jamie Shertzer. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.

7.3 **Licensed Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Nathan M. Childers. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.

7.4 **Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Max Burkhalter and Seth Knowles. **Applications deferred:** Tammie Davis Haddock. **Applications denied:** None.

7.5 **Certified General Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Todd Crawford, Britton Falkner, Robert Wayne Lancaster (Recip)(KY), and Tanya J. Pierson (Recip)(MN). **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** Joseph Gattozzi.

7.6 **Mentor applications approved:** Amber Amis and Windy Dobbs.
Application deferred: None. **Applications denied:** None.

8.0 Ms. Frost presented the Finance report and stated that the Board was 92% into Fiscal Year 2016 and 76% into budget expenditures. Ms. Frost stated that there were no negative trends that could not be reconciled at this time. On motion by Mr. Baker and second by Ms. McClammy, the Board voted to approve the Finance Report. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

RE-CONSIDERATION HEARING

At 10:02 a.m., Ms. Conway convened the re-consideration hearing for Mr. Charles Christopher Chatham on his application for a Reciprocal Certified Residential Real Property license. Mr. Chatham addressed the Board. Ms. Conway closed the hearing at 10:29 a.m. On motion by Mr. Baker and second by Mr. Cotter, the Board voted to approve Mr. Chatham's application. Ms. Frost opposed the motion. Those in favor were Mr. Baker, Mr. Cotter, Mr. Key, Mr. Butler, Ms. McClammy, Mr. Watson and Mr. Pettey. Motion carried.

9.0 On motion by Mr. Baker and second by Ms. Frost, the following education course and instructor recommendations was approved, deferred, or denied as indicated. Mr. Butler opposed the motion. Motion carried.

VALUOMETRICS

New Application:

(CE) Stats, Graphs and Data Science 1 – 14 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: George Dell)

Both Course and Instructor Approved

On motion by Mr. Baker and second by Ms. McClammy, the following education courses and instructor recommendations were approved, deferred, or denied as indicated. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

ALTERRA GROUP, LLC

Renewal Applications:

(CE) A Practical Guide to Appraisal Review – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Greg Stephens)

Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Appraisal of Single Family Residential New Construction – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: David Phillips)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Basic Charts and Graphs – 5 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Carol Trice)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) FHA Appraisals and Reporting Requirements – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructors: Peter Gillispie and Craig Julian)
Both Course and Instructors Approved

APPRAISAL INSTITUTE – ALABAMA CHAPTER

New Applications:

- (CE) Technology Tips for Real Estate Appraisers – 4 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Andrew Sheppard)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Condemnation Appraising: Principles and Applications – 21 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Stephen Roach)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Review Theory - General – 30 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Leslie Sellers)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Residential Applications Part 2 – 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: James Atwood)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

Renewal Applications:

- (CE) 2016-2017 USPAP 7-Hr Update Course – 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: James Atwood)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

CALYPSO CONTINUING EDUCATION

New Application:

- (CE) Victorian Era Architecture for Real Estate Professionals – 3 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Francis Finigan)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

Renewal Applications:

- (CE) A Brief Stroll Through America's Architectural Styles – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Francis Finigan)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) FHA Site Inspection – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Francis Finigan)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Environmental Hazards Impact on Value – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Francis Finigan)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Mold, A Growing Concern – 3 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Francis Finigan)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

CAREER WEBSCHOOL

Renewal Applications:

- (CE) 2016-2017 7 Hour Equivalent USPAP – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) A URAR Form Review – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Appraisal Math and Statistics – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Cost Approach Overview – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Income Capitalization Overview – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach – 14 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use – 14 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Residential Report Writing and Case Studies – 14 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Sales Comparison Approach – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) 2016-2017 15 Hour Equivalent USPAP – 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Basic Appraisal Procedures – 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Basic Appraisal Principles – 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach – 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use – 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Residential Report Writing and Case Studies – 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches – 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: AM Bud Black)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

MARSHALL & SWIFT / CORELOGIC

Renewal Application:

- (CE) Commercial Cost Approach Certification – 15 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Ed Martinez)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

MCKISSOCK, LP

New Applications:

- (CE) A Review of Disciplinary Cases: How to Avoid a Visit with the Licensing Board – 3 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Workfile Documentation for Appraisers – 4 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Fannie Mae Appraisal Guidelines: Debunking the Myths – 4 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Introduction to Expert Witness Testimony for Appraisers – To Do or Not to Do – 4 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Divorce and Estate Appraisals: Elements of Non-Lender Work – 4 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Appraisal of Self Storage Facilities – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Instructor Approved

Renewal Applications:

- (CE) 2016-2017 7 Hour National USPAP Update Course – 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Wally Czekalski, Chuck Huntoon, Larry McMillen, Steve Vehmeier and Steve Maher)
Both Course and Instructors Approved

- (CE) 2016-2017 7 Hour National USPAP Update Course – Online – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) A Review of Disciplinary Cases – Live Webinar – 3 Hours – Online
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Robert McClelland, Joshua Walitt and Steven Craddock)
Both Course and Instructors Approved

- (CE) Adjustments: Supported or Not Supported? – Live Webinar – 5 Hours – Online
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Robert McClelland, Joshua Walitt and Steven Craddock)
Both Course and Instructors Approved

- (CE) Advanced Hotel Appraising – Full Service Hotels – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Analyze This! Applications of Appraisal Analysis – Live Webinar – 4 Hours – Online
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Robert McClelland, Joshua Walitt and Steven Craddock)
Both Course and Instructors Approved

- (CE) Appraisal of Assisted Living Facilities– 8 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Appraisal of Fast Food Facilities – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Appraisal of Industrial Incubators – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Appraisal of Land Subject to Ground Leases – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Appraisal of Self-Storage Facilities – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Tracy Martin)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Appraisal of Single Tenant Distribution Center – 6 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Appraisal of Owner-Occupied Commercial Properties – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Appraisers: How to Recognize and Avoid Mortgage Fraud – 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Wally Czekalski, Charles Huntoon, Larry McMillen, Steve Vehmeier and Steve Maher)
Both Course and Instructors Approved
- (CE) Appraising Small Apartment Properties – 6 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Avoiding Mortgaged Fraud for Appraisers – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Basic Hotel Appraising – Limited Service Hotels – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Essential Elements of Disclosures & Disclaimers – 5 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Even Odder: More Oddball Appraisals – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Expert Witness for Commercial Appraisers – 12 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Expert Witness Testimony: To Do or Not to Do – Live Webinar – 4 Hours – Online
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Robert McClelland, Joshua Walitt and Steven Craddock)
Both Course and Instructors Approved
- (CE) Exploring Appraiser Liability – 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Wally Czekalski, Charles Huntoon, Larry McMillen, Steve Vehmeier and Steve Maher)
Both Course and Instructors Approved

- (CE) Fannie Mae Appraisal Guidelines – Live Webinar – 4 Hours – Online
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Robert McClelland, Joshua Walitt and Steven Craddock)
Both Course and Instructors Approved

- (CE) Fundamental Concepts of Analysis – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Introduction to Legal Descriptions – 2 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Introduction to the Uniform Appraisal Dataset – 2 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Land and Site Valuation – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Managing Appraiser Liability – 6 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Relocation Appraisal and the New ERC Form – 6 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) REO & Foreclosures – 5 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Residential Appraisal Review and USPAP Compliance – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Residential Report Writing: More Than Forms – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (CE) Reviewer’s Checklist – Live Webinar – 4 Hours – Online
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Robert McClelland, Joshua Walitt and Steven Craddock)
Both Course and Instructors Approved

- (CE) Strange but True: Appraising Complex Residential Properties – 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Wally Czekalski, Charles Huntoon, Larry McMillen, Steve Vehmeier and Steve Maher)
Both Course and Instructors Approved
- (CE) The Cost Approach – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) The Dirty Dozen – 3 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) The New FHA Handbook 4000.1 – Live Webinar – 5 Hours – Online
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Robert McClelland, Joshua Walitt and Steven Craddock)
Both Course and Instructors Approved
- (CE) The New FHA Handbook 4000.1– 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Wally Czekalski, Charles Huntoon, Larry McMillen, Steve Vehmeier and Steve Maher)
Both Course and Instructors Approved
- (CE) The New FHA Handbook 4000.1 – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) The Nuts & Bolts of Green Building for Appraisers – 3 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) The Sales Comparison Approach– 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Understanding Residential Construction – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (CE) Work File: Your Best Defense Against an Offense – Live Webinar – 5 Hours – Online
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Robert McClelland, Joshua Walitt and Steven Craddock)
Both Course and Instructors Approved

- (LIC) 2016-2017 15-Hour National USPAP - 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Advanced Residential Applications & Case Studies - 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Appraisal Subject Matter Electives - 20 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Basic Appraisal Principles - 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Basic Appraisal Procedures - 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Commercial Appraisal Review-Subject Matter Elective - 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) Expert Witness for Commercial Appraisers-Subject Matter Elective - 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Paul Lorenzen)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) General Appraiser Income Approach - 60 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use - 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach - 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) General Report Writing and Case Studies - 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Bruce Coin)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

- (LIC) General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach - 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use - 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Residential Report Writing & Case Studies - 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Residential Appraiser Site Valuation & Cost Approach - 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Residential Sales Comparison & Income Approaches - 30 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)
Both Course and Instructor Approved
- (LIC) Statistics, Modeling and Finance - 15 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF INDEPENDENT FEE APPRAISERS

Renewal Application:

- (CE) HUD Single Family Housing Policy Handbook – 4000.1 – Appraisal Overview– 7 Hours – Classroom
(Instructor: Mike Orman)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

OREP EDUCATION NETWORK

New Application:

- (LIC) FHA Appraisal Standards – 7 Hours – Online
(Instructor: Lore DeAstra)
Both Course and Instructor Approved

The Board discussed evaluation forms completed by the attendees of the first 'Common Mistakes Found During Investigations'. The Board gave Mr. Davis permission to modify the course as necessary.

The Board deferred discussion of the next course date until the November Board meeting.

10.0

AB 15-08, AB 15-21 On September 15, 2016 the Board approved a Consent Settlement Order from Dillard Richardson, Saltillo, Mississippi where Licensee agreed to a revocation of his Certified Residential appraiser license R01230. The violations in the two appraisal reports were: The assignment was for a Fannie Mae compliant appraisal with licensee as the only approved appraiser to complete the assignment. The assignment was appraiser specific and required that the interior and exterior inspections and all conclusions and opinions be by the assigned appraiser. Licensee did not inspect the subject property yet signed a certification that said the licensee had inspected the property. Also licensee certified that he "performed this appraisal", "developed my opinion of the market value" and all the other parts of the appraisal certification when in actuality this is false. Licensee's office was located more the 100 miles from the subject property and licensee did not have access to the local MLS for the area. Licensee having this information did not inform the client of this lack of geographic competency and did not take steps to become geographically competent by joining or accruing access to the local MLS and spending time in the areas of the subject and comparable sales to become knowledgeable with the different market perspectives that influence sales price. Without having access to the local MLS licensee utilized comparable sales that were located more than 60 miles from the subject in a completely different market area without making adjustments or discussing the difference in market area. The assignment was a Fannie Mae appraisal assignment and therefore had to conform to the appraisal assignment conditions found in the Fannie Mae Guidelines to meet the expectations of parties who regular users of Fannie Mae appraisals. During the review it was also noted that in the sales comparison approach under the area titled Verification Source, the Licensee reported Revenue Commissioner as the verification source and did not explain the efforts undertaken to verify the data used in the report. This was a Fannie Mae appraisal performed in 2015 and the Fannie Mae guidelines states, "Examples of verification sources include, but are not limited to, the buyer, seller, listing agent, selling agent, and closing documents in certain situations. Regardless of the source(s) used, there must be sufficient data to understand the conditions of sale, existence of financing concessions, physical characteristics of the property and whether it was an arms-length transaction." There was no exclamation as to any steps licensee took in trying to meet the Fannie Mae requirement. Licensee had no location adjustment made or no discussion on why none was needed for the comparable sales that were located over 60 miles away in different tax bases, different school systems, different governments and so on. It was also noted that there were several large adjustments made in the Sales Comparison Approach with no justification or explanation for these adjustments in the report or in the work file.

Licensee's failure to acknowledge the lack of geographic competency and not taking efforts to become geographically competent by joining or accruing access to a local data source, along with stating in the report that the comparable sales utilized in the report were the closest, most comparable sales for the subject even though the sales utilized were located more than 60 miles away in a different market area. These facts make this report misleading. **Violations: Standards Rule 2-1(a); 1-1; Scope of Work Acceptability; Competency Rule, USPAP, 2014-15 Edition.**

Ms. Conway discussed with the Board the investigative status charts. Ms. Conway informed the Board 2 new complaints were received since the July 2016 Board meeting, 7 complaints were dismissed, and 3 complaints were settled, leaving a total of 33 open complaints.

Mr. Key asked Ms. Conway to add the total number of complaints assigned for investigation to the Complaint Disposition Summary report.

Ms. Conway discussed the proposed engagement letter for verbal consultation on a conservation easement appraisal report complaint submitted by Ms. Susanne M. Curran. On motion by Mr. Baker and second by Ms. Frost, the Board voted to defer a vote on Ms. Curran's proposal until the November Board meeting. Motion carried by unanimous vote. Ms. Conway explained the contract process to the Board.

11.0 The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-15-25**: With Mr. Pettey, Mr. Butler and Mr. Key recusing, on motion by Mr. Baker and second by Ms. McClammy, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-16-01**: With Mr. Watson and Mr. Butler recusing, on motion by Mr. Baker and second by Mr. Pettey, the Board voted that probable cause does exist and to set this case for hearing. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-16-02**: With Mr. Butler, Mr. Key and Mr. Pettey recusing, on motion by Mr. Baker and second by Ms. McClammy, the Board voted that probable cause does exist and to issue a Letter of Warning. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-16-03**: With Mr. Butler, Mr. Key and Mr. Pettey recusing, on motion by Mr. Baker and second by Ms. Frost, the Board voted that probable cause does exist and to issue a Letter of Warning. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-16-05**: With Mr. Butler, Mr. Key, Mr. Watson and Mr. Pettey recusing, on motion by Mr. Baker and second by Ms. Frost, the Board voted that probable cause does exist and to set this case for hearing. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-16-06**: With Mr. Key recusing, on motion by Ms. Frost and second by Mr. Baker, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-16-14**: With Mr. Key recusing, on motion by Ms. Frost and second by Ms. McClammy, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-16-16**: With Mr. Key and Mr. Pettey recusing, on motion by Mr. Baker and second by Mr. Butler, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-16-17**: With Mr. Key recusing, on motion by Mr. Baker and second by Ms. McClammy, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

12.0 The Board reviewed the Consent Settlement Order on **AB-15-24**. With Mr. Key and Mr. Butler recusing, on motion by Mr. Pettey and second by Ms. McClammy, the Board voted to approve this Consent Settlement Order. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

13.0 The following reciprocal licenses were issued since the July Board meeting: Robert Wayne Lancaster ('G' KY), and Tanya J. Pierson ('G' MN).

14.0 The Temporary Permit report was provided to the Board for their information.

15.0 The Appraisal Management report was provided to the Board for their information.

16.0 Ms. Conway discussed a letter from Mr. Walter F. Scott, III, Esq., requesting a hearing to reconsider Declaratory Ruling # 2016-1. On motion by Ms. McClammy and second by Mr. Pettey, the Board voted to defer this matter until the November Board meeting. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board further discussed this matter and on motion by Ms. Frost and second by Ms. McClammy, the Board voted to rescind the previous vote to defer the matter until the November Board meeting. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

On motion by Ms. Frost and second by Ms. McClammy, the Board voted to hear from Mr. Scott at the November Board meeting on his request to reconsider Declaratory Ruling # 2016-1. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

Mrs. Greene reported to the Board that the Examiners of Public Accounts has instructed Mrs. Brooks to require the Board members to complete their travel forms themselves.

Mrs. Greene reported that Mrs. Brooks' annual raise had been approved by the State Personnel Board and that she is now at the top of her pay scale.

Ms. Conway informed the Board that Mrs. Margaret Anne Davis has been hired to fill the ASA I position.

Mrs. Greene discussed the Renewal Report with the Board.

17.0 There was no unfinished business to discuss at this time.

18.0 Mr. Pettey discussed calls he has received from appraisers regarding an Appraisal Management Company that is not registered that has been contacting the appraisers to do appraisals for them. The Appraisal Management Company says that they are exempt.

19.0 At 11:15 a.m., on motion by Mr. Baker and second by Ms. Frost, the Board voted to adjourn the regular Board meeting. Motion carried by unanimous vote. The Board's tentative meeting schedule for the remainder of 2016 is November 17, 2016 in the 3rd Floor Conference Room, 100 North Union Street, Montgomery, Alabama.

Sincerely,

Carolyn Greene
Executive Secretary
/cg

APPROVED: _____
Dennis Key, Chairman