

**MINUTES**  
**ALABAMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD**  
**RSA UNION STREET**  
**SUITE 370**  
**MONTGOMERY, ALABAMA**  
**November 17, 2016**

**MEMBERS PRESENT:**

Mr. Dennis Key (Chairman)  
Ms. Patrice McClammy  
Mr. Billy Cotter  
Mr. Richard D. Pettey  
Mr. Robert Butler  
Mr. Edmond G. Eslava, III

**MEMBERS ABSENT:**

Mr. Lew Watson (Vice-Chairman)  
Mr. Christopher Baker  
Ms. Angie Frost

**OTHERS PRESENT:**

Mrs. Lisa Brooks, Executive Director  
Ms. Neva Conway, Legal Counsel  
Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary  
Mr. Joe Dixon, Investigator

**GUESTS PRESENT:**

Mr. Walter Scott, III, Esq., Galloway Scott Moss & Hancock, LLC  
Mr. Keith Maddox, Esq., Alabama Department of Revenue  
Ms. Maria Knight, Jefferson County Board of Equalization  
Mrs. Jane Mardis, Chief Appraiser, Jefferson County Board of Equalization  
Mr. Derrick Coleman, Director, State of Alabama Department of Revenue, Property Tax Division  
Mr. Brady Rigdon, Assistant District Attorney representing Jefferson County Property Tax Division  
Mr. Joseph W. Gattozzi, Certified Residential Appraiser, Tuscaloosa

- 1.0 With quorum present, Mr. Dennis Key, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 9:06 a.m. Mrs. Carolyn Greene, Executive Secretary, recorded the minutes. The meeting was held in the 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Conference Room, 100 North Union Street, Montgomery, Alabama. Prior notice of the meeting was posted on the Secretary of State's website on February 2, 2016 in accordance with the Alabama Open Meetings Act.
- 2.0 The meeting was opened with prayer, led by Mr. Eslava, and the Pledge of Allegiance, led by Mr. Key.

Ms. Conway introduced Mrs. Margaret Anne Davis, ASA II, new Legal Research Assistant, to the Board.

3.0 Members present were, Mr. Billy Cotter, Mr. Edmond G. Eslava, III, Mr. Richard D. Pettey, Ms. Patrice McClammy, Mr. Robert Butler and Mr. Dennis Key. Members absent were Mr. Lew Watson, Mr. Christopher Baker, and Ms. Angie Frost.

4.0 On motion by Ms. McClammy and second by Mr. Butler, the regular minutes for September 15, 2016 were approved as written. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

5.0 Ms. Conway informed the Board that there is an administrative hearing set for January 19<sup>th</sup> after the Board meeting.

6.0 Ms. Conway discussed the Final Adoption of 780-X-4-.08, 'Miscellaneous Fees'. On motion by Mr. Pettey and second by Ms. McClammy, the Board voted to adopt the rules as published, and instructed Ms. Conway to file the rules for final adoption. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

7.0 On motion by Mr. Eslava and second by Mr. Pettey, the following applications were voted on as listed. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

7.1 **Trainee Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Marshall K. Davidson, Nicholas R. Davis, Stephanie B. Merciers, Robert Leland Stockton, III, and Benjamin Walker. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.

**Trainee Real Property Appraiser Experience Logs for Review:** **Logs approved:** None. **Log deferred:** Steve Kaiser. **Logs denied:** None.

7.2 **State Registered Real Property Appraiser application approved:** Calvin Powell Perryman. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.

7.3 **Licensed Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** None. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.

7.4 **Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Tammie Davis Haddock. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.

7.5 **Certified General Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Nicholas A. Barwig (Recip)(GA), Jason Eric Bearden (Recip)(GA), Devon Carter (Recip)(FL), Matthew J. Chiasson (Recip)(FL), Robert Jeffrey Fletcher (Recip)(TN), Michael Thomas Minix (Recip)(TX) and Christopher Pettey, Jr. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** Joseph Gattozzi.

7.6 **Mentor application approved:** Elizabeth Duggar. **Applications deferred:** None. **Applications denied:** None.

8.0 Mr. Pettey presented the Finance report and stated that the Board was 8% into Fiscal Year 2017 and 7% into budget expenditures. Mr. Pettey stated that there were no negative trends that could not be reconciled at this time. On motion by Mr. Eslava and second by Mr. Cotter, the Board voted to approve the Finance Report. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

9.0 On motion by Mr. Pettey and second by Mr. Butler, the following education courses and instructor recommendations was approved, deferred, or denied as indicated. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

### **AMERICAN CONTINUING EDUCATION INSTITUTE**

#### **New Application:**

(CE) 2016-2017 7 Hour Equivalent USPAP Update Course – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Steven Maher)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

### **AMERICAN SOCIETY OF FARM MANAGERS AND RURAL APPRAISERS**

#### **Renewal Application:**

(CE) 7 Hour National USPAP Course (A114) – 7 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Scott Seely)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

### **APPRAISER ELEARNING, A DIVISION OF STORYBOARD EMP, LLC**

#### **New Applications:**

(CE) Public Records, Square Footage & the Real Estate Information – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Bryan S. Reynolds)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

(CE) ANSI, Home Measurement & the Power of Price Per Square Foot – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Bryan S. Reynolds)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

## **APPRAISAL INSTITUTE – CHICAGO CHAPTER**

### **Renewal Applications:**

- (CE) (Online) Analyzing Operating Expenses – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Ken Foltz)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) (Online) Appraising Convenience Stores – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Robert Bainbridge)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) (Online) Business Practices and Ethics – 5 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Bruce Closser)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Business Practices and Ethics – 4 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Ken Foltz)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) (Online) Case Studies in Appraising Green Residential Buildings –  
7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Sandra Adomatis)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) (Online) Comparative Analysis – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Arlen Mills)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent – 4 Hours –  
Classroom  
(Instructor: Ken Foltz)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) (Online) Eminent Domain & Condemnation – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: John Underwood)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) FHA Appraising for Valuation Professionals – 7 Hours –  
Classroom  
(Instructor: Ken Foltz)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) (Online) Forecasting Revenue – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Ken Foltz)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

- (CE) International Valuation Standards Overview – 7 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Ken Foltz)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) (Online) Introduction to Green Buildings: Principles & Concepts – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Introduction to Green Buildings: Principles & Concepts – 7 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Ken Foltz)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) (Online) Reviewing Residential Appraisals & Using Fannie Mae Form 2000 – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Supervisory Appraiser / Trainee Appraiser Course – 4 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Sandra Adomatis)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) (Online) Thinking Outside the Form – 4 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Alan Simmons)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) (Online) The Discounted Cash Flow Model: Concepts, Issues & Applications – 5 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Ken Lusht)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Two Day Advanced Income Capitalization / A – 14 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Ken Foltz)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Two Day Advanced Income Capitalization / B – 14 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Ken Foltz)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Advanced Income Capitalization – 33 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: John Underwood)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

- (LIC) Advanced Income Capitalization - Synchronous– 35 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Tom Kirby)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
  
- (LIC) Advanced Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use – 35 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: John Underwood)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
  
- (LIC) Advanced Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use - Synchronous– 35 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Larry Wright)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
  
- (LIC) Advanced Residential Applications & Case Studies, Pt. 1 – 15 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Craig Harrington)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
  
- (LIC) Advanced Residential Report Writing, Part 2 – 30 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Craig Harrington)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
  
- (LIC) (Online) Basic Appraisal Principles – 30 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Richard Dubay)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
  
- (LIC) Basic Appraisal Principles – 30 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Craig Harrington)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
  
- (LIC) Basic Appraisal Procedures – 30 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Craig Harrington)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
  
- (LIC) General Appraiser Income Approach Part 1 – 30 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: John Underwood)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
  
- (LIC) (Online) General Appraiser Income Approach Part 1 – 30 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: David Lennhoff)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
  
- (LIC) General Appraiser Income Approach Part 2 – 30 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: John Underwood)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

- (LIC) (Online) General Appraiser Income Approach Part 2 – 30 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: David Lennhoff)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use – 30 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Robert Dunham)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use – 30 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: John Underwood)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach – 30 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: John Underwood)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) (Online) General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach – 30 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Ken Foltz)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) (Online) General Appraiser Site Valuation & Cost Approach – 30 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Arlen Mills)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Quantitative Analysis – Synchronous – 35 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Tom Hamilton)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Online Real Estate Finance, Statistics & Valuation Modeling – 15 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Ken Lusht)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Real Estate Finance, Statistics & Valuation Modeling – 15 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: John Underwood)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use – 15 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Craig Harrington)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

- (LIC) (Online) Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use – 15 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Tom Kirby)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) (Online) Residential Site Valuation & Cost Approach – 15 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Arlen Mills)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (LIC) Residential Site Valuation & Cost Approach – 15 Hours – Classroom  
(Instructor: Craig Harrington)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

### **GEORGIA MLS TRAINING INSTITUTE**

#### **Renewal Applications:**

- (CE) Defensible Appraising – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Wade Gaddy)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Methodology and Application of Sales Comparison – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Wade Gaddy)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) National Appraising for the Supervisor and Trainee – 4 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Wade Gaddy)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**
- (CE) Appraisal Review of Residential Properties – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Wade Gaddy)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

### **MCKISSOCK, LP**

#### **New Applications:**

- (CE) The Income Approach: An Overview – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)  
**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

(CE) Appraisal Practices of Manufactured Housing – Live Webinar – 4 Hours – Online  
(Instructors: Dan Bradley, Robert McClelland, Joshua Walitt and Steven Craddock)

**Both Course and Instructors Approved**

(CE) Supporting Your Adjustments – Methods for Residential Appraisers – 3 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

(CE) Residential Property Inspection for Appraisers – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Dan Bradley)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

### **OREP EDUCATION NETWORK**

#### **Renewal Application:**

(CE) How to Support and Prove Your Adjustments – 7 Hours – Online  
(Instructor: Richard Hagar)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

**The following appraisal course monitor report by Mr. Joe Dixon was included for Board information:**

Forest Valuation for Non-Foresters, taught by the Appraisal Institute - Alabama Chapter on October 7, 2016.

10.0 **AB 15-24** On September 15, 2016, the Board approved a Consent Settlement Order from a Certified Residential appraiser where Licensee agreed to a private reprimand, a \$2250 administrative fine and a 15 hour USPAP course with exam. The violations in the appraisal report were: The Board alleges Licensee failed to provide sufficient information to enable the intended user(s) of the written appraisal report to understand the report properly. Licensee, in the Site/Zoning Description section, provided the description of the R-1 zoning as Residential. Residential does not provide sufficient information, for the intended user to understand what type of residential use single family residential, multi-family residential, etc., that would be permitted in the R-1 specific zoning classification. Licensee failed to provide an analyses of the amount of waterfront, type of access to the waterfront from the street, topography of the property in relation to the street and waterfront (functional utility) and other characteristics associated with property being located on a river. In the Reconciliation section, Licensee failed to reconcile the applicability and relevance of the Cost Approach being employed within the appraisal assignment.

The Board alleges Licensee failed to clearly and accurately set forth the appraisal in a manner that was not misleading. In the Neighborhood/Marketing Time section the Marketing Time is indicated as 3-6 months. In the Neighborhood/Market Conditions section, Marketing Time is indicated as 1-12 months. In the Site/Dimensions section Licensee provided the rear dimension (waterfront side of lot) as 576 feet. Licensee failed to recognize the dimension was grossly inaccurate and reported the dimension without sufficient verification. MLS reported 179 feet of waterfront. Licensee, within the Sales Comparison Approach/Comparable #1/Date of Sale section, reported sale occurred in 2013 when the actual date was 2014, for the contract date and sale date. Licensee, within the Supplemental Addendum section, provided a comment the effective age of the comparables could not be determined due to the lack of an interior inspection. In another paragraph of the Supplement Addendum, Licensee provided the condition of a comparable could be determined from MLS data. The comments conflict and is not clear, since the effective age of a property is a component of the condition of the property.

The Board alleges Licensee provided a flawed reconciliation in developing the Indicated Value by the Sales Comparison Approach. Licensee commented in the Additional Comment section - Sale #4 was given the most weight due to 'Relatively Low' net adjustment percentages and proximity. Licensee made a conflicting comment in the Comment Addendum - Sale #1 is given the most weight due to 'Relatively Low' net adjustment percentages. It is not clear in the appraisal report which sale was given the most weight due to the conflicting comments. Licensee analyzed an arms-length sale, conventional financing, SP=\$450,000, which was not the terms of the sales contract and addendum.

The Board alleges Licensee failed to collect, verify and analyze all information necessary for credible assignment results in the approaches employed and failed to analyze the Subject property storage buildings and bulkhead when compared to the comparables. Subject features not analyzed, where a comparative analysis could be provided. Licensee, within Comparable #1, analyzed the property as being waterfront with a pier. Licensee failed to analyze the length of the waterfront (110 feet) with a bulkhead, boat shelter, boat lift, dock and home generator and changed the condition adjustment from -\$10,000 in the original appraisal report to -\$25,000 in the amended report without support for the change in the workfile. Licensee, within Comparable #2, analyzed the property as being waterfront with a pier. Licensee failed to analyze the length of the waterfront (240 feet), boat facility with boat/wave runner lifts, loft, fish cleaning station, wet bar and dining area and changed the quality of construction adjustment from -\$10,000, in the original appraisal report to -\$25,000 in the amended reports of the subject property without support in the workfile. Licensee, within Comparable #3, analyzed the property as being waterfront. Licensee failed to analyze the waterfront length (100 feet) with a bulkhead. Licensee changed the condition rating from C4 (\$0 adjustment) in the original appraisal report to C5 in the amended reports

with a + \$25,000 condition adjustment. The Supplemental Addendum page of the amended report stated the change was at the lender/client request. There was no support in the workfile for the change. Licensee, within Comparable #4, analyzed the property as being waterfront with a pier. Licensee failed to analyze the length of waterfront (200 feet) with a wharf or the storage building. Licensee, within Comparable #5, analyzed the property as being waterfront. Licensee failed to analyze the waterfront of 124 feet with a bulkhead and the one bedroom/one bath cottage. Licensee, within Comparable #6, analyzed the property as being waterfront with a pier. Licensee failed to analyze the reported 150 feet of waterfront with a boat lift, dock with boat slip and bulkhead, home generator and adjusted for only one of three fireplaces for the home. Licensee, changed the quality of construction adjustment from -\$10,000, in the original appraisal report to -\$25,000 in the amended reports without support in the workfile. The effective age was not supported in the appraisal report nor documented in Licensee's workfile. Licensee provided an opinion of value in the original report dated February 13, 2015 as \$450,000 and February 16, 2015, as \$450,000 and in subsequent revised reports dated February 25, 2015, February 26, 2015 and March 2, 2015 as \$365,000. The Board alleges that Licensee failed to provide analyses to justify the decrease in the value opinion and failed to completely analyze the agreement of sale and only one of the parcels of property under contract was appraised.

The Board alleges Licensee failed to fully disclose the research and analysis performed and the research and analysis not performed by Licensee for the waterfront property appraisal assignment.

The Board alleges Licensee failed to prepare a complete workfile of an appraisal assignment insofar as his workfile did not contain support of the opinion and conclusions of the effective age, Cost Approach, and the opinions/conclusions provided within the Sales Comparison Approach.

The Board alleges Licensee failed to comply with the Conduct section of the Ethics Rule of the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice by willfully and knowingly prepared an appraisal assignment of waterfront property in a grossly negligent manner by having knowledge of the characteristics of waterfront property and failing to analyze these characteristics for the appraisal assignment. The value difference in the original appraisal report and several revised appraisal reports was not explained in the report nor supported by the workfile. The Board further alleges Licensee failed to prepare a complete workfile of the assignment and willfully or knowingly violated the requirements of the Record Keeping Rule. **Violations:** Standards Rule 2-1(b); Standards Rule 2-1(a); Standards Rule 1-6(a); Standards Rule 1-5(a); Standards Rule 1-4(a); Standards Rule 1-3(a); Standards Rule 1-1(b); SCOPE OF WORK RULE; RECORD KEEPING RULE; ETHICS RULE, **USPAP, 2014-15 Edition.**

**Letters of Warning** were issued on the following investigations for the discrepancies indicated. This disciplinary action will be considered in any future discipline proceedings:

**AB 16-02** The appraisal of vacant land where the actual use or the highest and best use is not residential one to four is outside the scope of the Certified Residential appraiser license if the transaction value is over \$250,000. The highest and best use analysis in this appraisal is marginal. §34-27A-4, Code of Alabama, 1975.

**AB 16-03** The appraisal of vacant land where the actual use or the highest and best use is not residential one to four is outside the scope of the Certified Residential appraiser license if the transaction value is over \$250,000. The highest and best use analysis in this appraisal is marginal. §34-27A-4, Code of Alabama, 1975.

Ms. Conway discussed with the Board the investigative status charts. Ms. Conway informed the Board 6 new complaints were received since the September 2016 Board meeting, 5 complaints were dismissed, and 3 complaints were settled, leaving a total of 31 open complaints.

Mr. Walter Scott addressed the Board regarding concerns with Declaratory Ruling 2016-1.

Mr. Derrick Coleman addressed the Board regarding his support of the Declaratory Ruling.

Mr. Joe Gattozzi addressed the Board regarding appraisals of 1 to 4 family units. Mr. Eslava asked the Board to write Ms. Shannon Reyome of Valuation Management Group regarding the issue.

Ms. Conway discussed the review of disciplinary cases in committee discussion and cautioned the Board about potential issues.

11.0 The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-15-28**: With Mr. Key, Mr. Butler and Mr. Pettey recusing, on motion by Mr. Eslava and second by Mr. Cotter, the Board voted that probable cause does exist and to set this case for hearing. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-16-13**: With Mr. Butler, recusing, on motion by Mr. Pettey and second by Mr. Eslava, the Board voted that probable cause does not exist and to dismiss this case. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

12.0 The Board reviewed the Consent Settlement Order on **AB-16-01 (Travis Grant Berry, R00784)**. With Mr. Butler recusing, on motion by Mr. Pettey and second by Ms. McClammy, the Board voted to approve this Consent Settlement Order. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

13.0 The following reciprocal licenses were issued since the September Board meeting: Nicholas Alexander Barwig ('G' GA), Jason Eric Bearden ('G' GA), Devon Carter ('G' FL), Charles Christopher Chatham ('R' TN), Matthew Joseph Chiasson ('G' FL), Robert Jeffery Fletcher ('G' TN), and Michael Thomas Minix ('G' TX).

- 14.0 The Temporary Permit report was provided to the Board for their information.
- 15.0 The Appraisal Management report was provided to the Board for their information.
- 16.0 Mrs. Brooks discussed the sale of USPAP books with the Board.
- Mrs. Brooks discussed the Renewal Report with the Board.
- Mr. Eslava discussed late fees incurred by all of the appraisers employed by Courtney & Morris.
- Mrs. Brooks discussed the reimbursement received for the sale of the Impala.
- Mrs. Brooks presented a letter from Mr. William E. Bryant, requesting assistance in resolving some confusion related to the limits that were placed upon Certified Residential Real Property Appraisers around 1989. The Board discussed Mr. Bryant's request. Ms. Conway will respond to Mr. Bryant.
- Ms. Conway discussed the RFP for a Customary and Reasonable Fee Study received from Dr. David L. Turnipseed, Ph.D. Mr. Eslava moved that the Board accept the proposal subject to revisions made at no additional charge, that Mrs. Brooks contract with Dr. Turnipseed and that Ms. Conway submit the contract for review. Mr. Cotter seconded the motion. Mr. Eslava will discuss this with Dr. Turnipseed. The Board members will send suggestions to Ms. Conway. Mrs. Brooks asked that Ms. Frost and Mr. Baker review the revisions. Motion carried by unanimous vote.
- 17.0 The Board discussed the proposed engagement letter for verbal consultation on a conservation easement appraisal complaint submitted by Ms. Susanne M. Curran. On motion by Mr. Cotter and second by Mr. Pettey the Board voted to accept Ms. Curran's proposal, that Mrs. Brooks contract with Dr. Turnipseed and that Ms. Conway submit the contract for review. Ms. McClammy opposed the motion, stating she would have preferred to have entertained more proposals. Mr. Butler abstained. Motion carried.
- 18.0 There was no new business to discuss at this time.
- 19.0 At 11:55 a.m., on motion by Ms. McClammy and second by Mr. Eslava, the Board voted to adjourn the regular Board meeting. Motion carried by unanimous vote. The Board's tentative meeting schedule for the 2017 is January 19, 2017, March 16, 2017, May 18, 2017, July 20, 2017, September 21, 2017 and November 16, 2017 in the 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Conference Room, 100 North Union Street, Montgomery, Alabama.

Sincerely,

Carolyn Greene  
Executive Secretary  
/cg

**APPROVED:** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Dennis Key, Chairman**